

JUDICIAL APPOINTMENTS COMMISSION (JAC) MEETING
12 November 2015
Minutes of Meeting

Present	
Commissioners	Staff
Christopher Stephens (Chairman) Ian Burnett (Vice Chairman) Emily Jackson Usha Karu Noel Lloyd Alexandra Marks Katharine Rainsford Andrew Ridgway Lucy Scott-Moncrieff Christopher Simmonds Valerie Strachan Phillip Sycamore Alan Wilkie	Chief Executive Head of Operations Head of Policy and Change Senior Communications Manager Senior Manager, Operational Policy Organisational Psychologist Private Secretary to the Chairman Board Secretary

1. Apologies, and matters arising

1.1 Apologies were received from Debra Van Gene and Martin Forde.

1.2 The Chairman welcomed Ian Burnett, the new Vice-Chairman, to the Board and introductions were made.

1.3 All Commissioners confirmed that they had no personal interest in any matters to be discussed on the agenda.

1.4 The minutes of the 8 October meeting were agreed and the Board Action Register noted.

2. Chairman's Report

2.1 The Chairman provided an update on his activities since his last report at the October meeting. He reported that he had met with the Lord Chief Justice, and attended and spoke at the Court of Appeal Away Day. He also reported that he had met with Dame Janet Paraskeva in relation to judicial appointments in the Courts of Jersey. He reported on his attendance at the Legal Wales Conference, along with Noel Lloyd, and at the JAC 10th anniversary conference in Birmingham together with other JAC Commissioners and staff.

2.2 The Chairman then invited Commissioners to comment on relevant activities of particular interest with which they had been involved. Emily Jackson, Usha Karu, Alexandra Marks and Lucy Scott-Moncrieff, each reported on their attendance at the JAC 10th anniversary conference in Birmingham. Lastly, Alexandra Marks reported on her attendance at a Law Society event for women returners to the solicitors' profession.

3. Chief Executive's Report and Management Information Pack

3.1 The Head of Policy and Change provided an oral update on current activity at the JAC. She reported on the JAC's financial position, confirming the JAC's budget indication for 2015/16 of £4.4m.

3.2 The Head of Policy and Change then reported on staffing levels at the JAC, stating that key replacements for some staff vacancies were beginning to arrive.

3.3 The Head of Policy and Change then provided an overview of the selection exercise programme for the remainder of the current financial year, and progress in key areas of the business plan.

3.4 The Commission considered the monthly Management Information Pack. The Pack provided an overview of JAC activity up to the end of October 2015.

4. Use of Judicial Resources – Moderation

4.1 The Senior Manager (Operational Policy) presented a paper seeking the Commission's approval to proposals to take only panel chairs to moderation in two upcoming exercises: Resident Judge of the First-tier Tribunal, Immigration and Asylum Chamber and the s9(1) Deputy High Court Judge exercises. In addition, Commissioners were asked to agree, subject to any concerns arising from the pilots, to the rollout of this initiative to the Circuit Judge exercise and further exercises.

4.2 Commissioners noted that this was the first proposal to be brought to the Board following their workshop in September, where they had agreed to explore ways to make more effective use of judicial time in JAC processes, in light of limited judicial availability.

4.2 After careful consideration, the Commission agreed to the proposal to take only panel chairs to moderation in the three initial exercises. Rollout to other exercises would be subject to an evaluation of these three initial exercises, including feedback from the lay and judicial panellists. In light of the timing involved, this evaluation would be shared out of committee.

5. Section 94 list review

5.1 The Head of Operations presented a paper seeking the Commission's decision in relation to a list that had been established under s94 of the Constitutional Reform Act (CRA) 2005 for vacancies which may arise in the foreseeable future. The list had been created in December

2014 following the completion of the 2014 Fee-paid Judge of the First-tier Tribunal, Tax Chamber selection exercise.

5.2 The Commission agreed to close the list at the 12 month point in line with its agreed policy, as there was no expectation that further judges would be required in the near future.

6. Selection Tools Menu

6.1 The Head of Policy and Change presented a paper requesting that the Commission note the expanded range of selection tools on the menu that can be used in individual selection exercises as appropriate. Several had now been added to the menu following development and evaluation as part of the selection process review. Commissioners noted that each individual tool will be available for use in selection exercises without the need to bring individual exercise processes to the Board for consideration and approval.

6.2 The Commission noted that all selection tools have been previously approved for use by the Commission Board, and have been piloted where appropriate.

6.3 Commissioners further noted that the selection exercise and policy teams would continue to work together to design individual selection exercises, drawing on the range of tools available. They welcomed the plan to develop further guidance on where each tool would be most suitable, based on an ongoing evaluation of how the tools are being used in practice and their effectiveness.

7. Report Back from Working Groups

7.1 Valerie Strachan, Chair of the Audit and Risk Committee, provided the Commission with an update of the Committee's meeting of 22 October 2015. She informed the Commission that the Committee considered the Management Information Plan, Corporate Risk Register and the JAC Business Plan. She noted that the Committee had been particularly concerned about staffing levels. The Committee had also discussed progress towards the implementation of recommendations arising from internal and external audit reports.

7.2 Emily Jackson, Chair of the Advisory Group, provided the Commission with an update on the Group's meeting held on 23 September. She referred to some of the recent changes to the format of the Group's meetings, but suggested that further consideration was needed regarding the question of how to maximise the potential contribution from the group.

Date of next meeting

The Chairman confirmed that the next Board meeting would be held on **Thursday 10 December 2015**.