

JUDICIAL APPOINTMENTS COMMISSION (JAC) MEETING

9 February 2023

Minutes of Board Meeting

Present	
Commissioners	Staff
Helen Pitcher (Chair) Adam Johnson (interim Vice Chair) Mathangi Asokan Jane Furniss Sue Hoyle Andrew Kennon Sarah Lee Barry Morgan Greg Sinfield Brie Stevens-Hoare	Chief Executive Deputy Chief Executive Head of Operations and Digital Head of Operational Delivery Head of Diversity and Engagement Head of Selection Policy Head of Secretariat/Board Secretary Secretariat Officer Senior Selection Exercise Manager Selection Exercise Manager Senior Stakeholder Engagement and Diversity Manager
Apologies Christa Christensen Anuja Dhir Emir Feisal Simon Wessely	

1. Apologies and matters arising

- 1.1 The minutes of the 15 December 2022 meeting were agreed.
- 1.2 Apologies were received from Christa Christensen, Anuja Dhir, Emir Feisal and Simon Wessely.

2. Chief Executive's Report and Management Information Pack

- 2.1 The Chief Executive:
 - shared a letter from CiLEX to the previous Chair, Lord Kakkar, offering their highest honour: appointment as an Honorary Companion of the Chartered Institute. This was in recognition of contributions to the improvement of the diversity of judicial appointments and support of CiLEX;
 - provided an update on the business plan and the 2021-22 and 2022-23 selection exercise programmes;
 - provided a legally privileged update on ongoing litigation; and
 - provided an update on the JAC's financial position and allocation for 2022-23.

3. Report back from Committees and Working Groups

3.1 The Chair asked Commissioners to report back on recent meetings of committees and working groups.

Advisory Group

3.2 Sue Hoyle reported back from the Advisory Group (AG) which was held on 24 January.

3.3 The AG reviewed:

- the qualifying test (situational judgement and critical analysis) for Fee-paid First-tier Tribunal and Employment Tribunal;
- the situational questions for Fee-paid Medical Members of the First-tier Tribunal, Health, Education and Social Care Chamber (Mental Health);
- the situational questions High Court;
- the situational questions Regional Judge of the First-tier Tribunal, Property Chamber, Residential Property; and
- the situational questions District Judge.

3.4 The AG welcomed two new members who had been nominated by the Senior President of Tribunals.

Audit and Risk Committee

3.5 Jane Furniss reported back from the Audit and Risk Committee (ARC), which was held on 26 January.

3.6 The ARC had a regular review of the corporate risk register. The ARC also conducted a deep dive discussion into the 'Failure of the Digital Services' risk.

3.7 The ARC received an update on all internal and external audit activity.

3.8 The ARC reviewed the results of its annual self-assessment questionnaire.

Digital Board

- 3.9 Andrew Kennon reported back from the Digital Board (DB), which was held on 26 January 2023
- 3.10 The DB welcomed a new independent member to their first meeting.
- 3.11 The DB noted recent progress against their Digital roadmap.
- 3.12 The DB were updated on the RAID (Risks, Assumptions, Issues and Dependencies) Log.

Welsh Matters Committee

- 3.13 Barry Morgan reported back from the Welsh Matters Committee (WMC), which was held on 9 February.
- 3.14 The WMC considered exercises with Welsh posts currently in progress and heard an update on progress from the action register.
- 3.15 The WMC discussed outreach for Welsh speaking panel members.

4. Chairman's Report

- 4.1 The Chair reported back on the process for the Lord Chief Justice recruitment campaign.
- 4.2 The Chair attended a meeting with the Lord Chief Justice on 30 January.
- 4.3 The Chair provided an update on Commissioner recruitment.
- 4.4 Brie Stevens-Hoare reported back on a recent outreach event that she attended for two upcoming First-tier Tribunal exercises.

5. Fee Paid First-tier Tribunal and Employment Tribunal Selection Exercise Process

- 5.1 The Senior Selection Exercise Manager presented the proposed selection process for the forthcoming Fee Paid First-tier Tribunal and Employment Tribunal exercise due to launch in March 2023.
- 5.2 Following discussion, the Board agreed to the process set out in the paper.

6. Employment Judge (England and Wales) Selection Exercise Process

6.1 The Selection Exercise Manager presented the proposed selection process for the forthcoming Employment Judge (England and Wales) exercise due to launch in March 2023.

6.2 Following discussion, the Board agreed to the process set out in the paper.

7 Board Effectiveness Review

7.1 The Head of Secretariat presented a paper on the results of a Board Effectiveness review carried out in December 2022.

7.2 The Board reflected on the results of the review and identified the priority areas to take forward in terms of the continuous improvement of the effectiveness of the Board.

7.3 The Board agreed to set up a subgroup of Commissioners to form a working group to take this forward.

8 Conflict of Interest Guidance review

8.1 The Secretariat Officer presented a paper setting out the recommended changes to the Board's rules on Conflicts of Interests.

8.2 Following a discussion, the Board accepted the proposals in the paper.

9 Evaluation of online Equal Merit Provision (EMP) tie-break pilot

9.1 The Senior Stakeholder Engagement and Diversity Manager presented a paper on the evaluation of the EMP online tie-break test pilot.

9.2 The Board noted that the tie-break test had been successfully piloted three times and had been found to be effective in differentiating between candidates in the tie-break stage.

9.3 Following a discussion, the Board agreed to the proposals that the EMP online tie-break test is adopted for fee-paid roles (below Deputy High Court level).

10 Forward Look and AOB

10.1 The Board noted the 2022 and 2023 Forward Look and that the next Board meeting would be held on 9 March 2023.